# BeBOP: <br> Berkeley Benchmarking and Optimization 

# Automatic Performance Tuning of Numerical Kernels 

James Demmel
EECS and Math UC Berkeley

Katherine Yelick EECS
UC Berkeley

Support from DOE SciDAC, NSF, Intel

## Performance Tuning Participants

- Faculty
- Michael Jordan, William Kahan, Zhaojun Bai (UCD)
- Researchers
- Mark Adams (SNL), David Bailey (LBL), Parry Husbands (LBL), Xiaoye Li (LBL), Lenny Oliker (LBL)
-PhD Students
- Rich Vuduc, Yozo Hida, Geoff Pike
- Undergrads
- Brian Gaeke, Jen Hsu, Shoaib Kamil, Suh Kang, Hyun Kim, Gina Lee, Jaeseop Lee, Michael de Lorimier, Jin Moon, Randy Shoopman, Brandon Thompson


## Outline

- Motivation, History, Related work
- Tuning Sparse Matrix Operations
-Results on Sun Ultra 1/170
- Recent results on P4
- Recent results on Itanium
- Some (non SciDAC) Target Applications
- SUGAR - a MEMS CAD system
- Information Retrieval
- Future Work


## Motivation History Related Work

## Conventional Performance Tuning

- Motivation: performance of many applications dominated by a few kernels
- Vendor or user hand tunes kernels
- Drawbacks:
- Very time consuming and tedious work
- Even with intimate knowledge of architecture and compiler, performance hard to predict
- Growing list of kernels to tune
- Example: New BLAS Standard
- Must be redone for every architecture, compiler
- Compiler technology often lags architecture
- Not just a compiler problem:
- Best algorithm may depend on input, so some tuning at run-time.
- Not all algorithms semantically or mathematically equivalent


## Automatic Performance Tuning

- Approach: for each kernel

1. Identify and generate a space of algorithms
2. Search for the fastest one, by running them

- What is a space of algorithms?
- Depending on kernel and input, may vary
- instruction mix and order
- memory access patterns
- data structures
- mathematical formulation
-When do we search?
- Once per kernel and architecture
- At compile time
- At run time
- All of the above


## Some Automatic Tuning Projects

- PHIPAC (www.icsi.berkeley.edu/~bilmes/phipac) (Bilmes,Asanovic,Vuduc,Demmel)
- ATLAS (www.netlib.org/atlas) (Dongarra, Whaley; in Matlab)
- XBLAS (www.nersc.gov/~xiaoye/XBLAS) (Demmel, X. Li)
- Sparsity (www.cs.berkeley.edu/~yelick/sparsity) (Yelick, Im)
- FFTs and Signal Processing
- FFTW (www.fftw.org)
- Won 1999 Wilkinson Prize for Numerical Software
- SPIRAL (www.ece.cmu.edu/~spiral)
- Extensions to other transforms, DSPs
- UHFFT
- Extensions to higher dimension, parallelism
- Special session at ICCS 2001
- Organized by Yelick and Demmel
- www.ucalgary.ca/iccs
- Proceedings available
- Pointers to other automatic tuning projects at
- www.cs.berkeley.edu/~yelick/iccs-tune


## Tuning pays off - PHIPAC (Bilmes, Asanovic, Vuduc, Demmel)




## Tuning pays off - ATLAS (Dongarra, Whaley)

$500 \times 500$ Double Precision Matrix-Matrix Multiply Across Multiple Architectures


## Search for optimal register tile sizes on Sun Ultra 10



16 registers, but 2-by-3 tile size fastest

## Search for Optimal LO block size in dense matmul

The Variations in Performance across Platforms


## High precision dense mat-vec multiply (XBLAS)



## High Precision Algorithms (XBLAS)

- Double-double (High precision word represented as pair of doubles)
- Many variations on these algorithms; we currently use Bailey's
- Exploiting Extra-wide Registers
- Suppose $s(1)$, ... , $s(n)$ have f-bit fractions, SUM has F>f bit fraction
- Consider following algorithm for $S=\Sigma_{i=1, n} s(i)$
- Sort so that $|s(1)| \geq|s(2)| \geq \cdots \geq|s(n)|$
- $S U M=0$, for $i=1$ to $n S U M=S U M+s(i)$, end for, sum = SUM
- Theorem (D., Hida) Suppose F<2f (less than double precision)
- If $n \leq 2^{F-f}+1$, then error $\leq 1.5$ ulps
- If $n=2^{F-f}+2$, then error $\leq 2^{2 f-F}$ ulps (can be $\gg 1$ )
- If $n \geq 2^{F-f}+3$, then error can be arbitrary ( $S \neq 0$ but sum $=0$ )
- Examples
- s(i) double ( $f=53$ ), SUM double extended ( $F=64$ )
- accurate if $n \leq 2^{11}+1=2049$
- Dot product of single precision $x(i)$ and $y(i)$
- $s(i)=x(i)^{\star} y(i) \quad\left(f=2^{*} 24=48\right)$, SUM double extended $(F=64) \Rightarrow$
- accurate if $n \leq 2^{16}+1=65537$


## Tuning Sparse Matrix Computations

## Tuning Sparse matrix-vector multiply

- Sparsity
- Optimizes y $=A^{*} \times$ for a particular sparse $A$
- Im and Yelick
- Algorithm space
- Different code organization, instruction mixes
- Different register blockings (change data structure and fill of $A$ )
- Different cache blocking
- Different number of columns of $x$
- Different matrix orderings
- Software and papers available
- www.cs.berkeley.edu/~yelick/sparsity


## How Sparsity tunes $y=A^{*} x$

- Register Blocking
- Store matrix as dense $r \times c$ blocks
- Precompute performance in Mflops of dense $A^{*} \times$ for various register block sizes $r \times c$
- Given A, sample it to estimate Fill if A blocked for varying $r \times c$
- Choose $r \times c$ to minimize estimated running time Fill/Mflops
- Store explicit zeros in dense $r \times c$ blocks, unroll
- Cache Blocking
- Useful when source vector $x$ enormous
- Store matrix as sparse $2^{k} \times 2^{l}$ blocks
- Search over $2^{k} \times 2^{l}$ cache blocks to find fastest


## Register-Blocked Performance of SPMV on Dense Matrices (up to 12x12)

333 MHz Sun Ultra IIi

1.5 GHz Pentium 4


800 MHz Pentium III


800 MHz Itanium


250 Mflops


## Which other sparse operations can we tune?

- General matrix-vector multiply $A^{*} x$
- Possibly many vectors $x$
- Symmetric matrix-vector multiply $A^{*} x$
- Solve a triangular system of equations $T^{-1 *} x$
- $y=A^{\top *} A^{*} x$
- Kernel of Information Retrieval via LSI (SVD)
- Same number of memory references as $A^{*} x$
- $y=\Sigma_{i}(A(i,:))^{\top}$ * $\left(A(i,:)^{*} x\right)$
- Future work
- $A^{2 *} x, A^{k *} x$
- Kernel of Information Retrieval used by Google
- Includes Jacobi, SOR, ...
- Changes calling algorithm
- $A^{\top \star} M^{\star} A$
- Matrix triple product
- Used in multigrid solver
- What does SciDAC need?


## Test Matrices

- General Sparse Matrices
- Up to $n=76 \mathrm{~K}, \mathrm{nnz}=3.21 \mathrm{M}$
- From many application areas
- 1 - Dense
- 2 to 17 - FEM
- 18 to 39 - assorted
- 41 to 44 - linear programming
- 45 - LSI
- Symmetric Matrices
- Subset of General Matrices
- 1 - Dense
- 2 to 8 - FEM
- 9 to 13 - assorted
- Lower Triangular Matrices
- Obtained by running SuperLU on subset of General Sparse Matrices
- 1 - Dense
- 2-13-FEM
- Details on test matrices at end of talk

Results on Sun Ultra 1/170

## Speedups on SPMV from Sparsity on Sun Ultra 1/170-1 RHS

Speedup for Sparse Matrix-vector-multiply with one vector


## Speedups on SPMV from Sparsity on Sun Ultra 1/170-9 RHS

Speedup for Sparse Matric-vector-multiply with multiple vectors


## Speed up from Cache Blocking on LSI matrix on Sun Ultra



## Recent Results on P4 using icc and gcc

## Speedup of SPMV from Sparsity on P4/icc-5.0.1

Speedup of Register Blocking Optimization (non-symmetric) [Pentium 4/Intel icc-5.0.1]


## Single vector speedups on P4 by matrix type - best $r \times c$



## Performance of SPMV from Sparsity on P4/icc-5.0.1



## Sparsity cache blocking results on P4 for LSI



## Fill for SPMV from Sparsity on P4/icc-5.0.1

Fill due to Register Blocking (non-symmetric) [Pentium 4/Intel icc-5.0.1]


## Multiple vector speedups on P4



## Multiple vector speedups on P4 - by matrix type



## Multiple Vector Performance on P4



## Symmetric Sparse Matrix-Vector Multiply on P4 (vs naïve full = 1)



## Sparse Triangular Solve (Matlab's colmmd ordering) on P4




Preliminary Results on Itanium using ecc

## Speedup of SPMV from Sparsity on Itanium/ecc-5.0.1



## Single vector speedups on Itanium by matrix type



## Raw Performance of SPMV from Sparsity on Itanium

Performance of Register Blocking Optimization (non-symmetric) [ttanium/Intel ecc-5.0.1]


## Fill for SPMV from Sparsity on Itanium

Fill due to Register Blocking (non-symmetric) [Itanium/Intel ecc-5.0.1]


## Improvements to register block size selection

Sparsity Non-symmetric Register Profile [Itanium-ecc]


- Initial heuristic to determine best $r \times c$ block biased to diagonal of performance plot
- Didn't matter on Sun, does on P4 and Itanium since performance so "nondiagonally dominant"
- Matrix 8:
- Chose 2x2 (164 Mflops)
- Better: 3x1 (196 Mflops)
- Matrix 9:
- Chose 2x2 (164 Mflops)
- Better: 3x1 (213 Mflops)


## Multiple vector speedups on Itanium



## Multiple vector speedups on Itanium - by matrix type



## Multiple Vector Performance on Itanium



## Speed up from Cache Blocking on LSI matrix on Itanium

Speedup of Cache Blocking: LSI ( $10 \mathrm{~K} \times 255 \mathrm{~K}$ ); naive $=25 \mathrm{Mflop} / \mathrm{s}$ [itanium-ecc]


# Applications of Performance Tuning (non SciDAC) 

## SUGAR - A CAD Tool for MEMS

## Applications to SUGAR - a tool for MEMS CAD

- Demmel, Bai, Pister, Govindjee, Agogino, Gu, ...
- Input: description of MicroElectroMechanical System (as netlist)
- Output:
- DC, steady state, modal, transient analyses to assess behavior
- CIF for fabrication
- Simulation capabilities
- Beams and plates (linear, nonlinear, prestressed,...)
- Electrostatic forces, circuits
- Thermal expansion, Couette damping
- Availability
- Matlab
- Publicly available
- www-bsac.eecs.berkeley.edu/~cfm
- 249 registered users, many unregistered
- Web service - M \& MEMS
- Runs on Millennium
- sugar.millennium.berkeley.edu
- Now in use in EE 245 at UCB... 96 users
- Lots of new features being added, including interface to measurements


## Micromirror (Last, Pister)

- Laterally actuated torsionally suspended micromirror
- Over 10K dof, 100 line netlist (using subnets)
- DC and frequency analysis
- All algorithms reduce to previous kernels




# Applications of Performance Tuning 

## Information Retrieval

## Information Retrieval

- Jordan
- Collaboration with Intel team building probabilistic graphical models
- Better alternatives to LSI for document modeling and search
- Latent Dirichlet Allocation (LDA)
- Model documents as union of themes, each with own word distribution
- Maximum likelihood fit to find themes in set of documents, classify them
- Computational bottleneck is solution of enormous linear systems
- One of largest Millennium users
- Identifying influential documents
- Given hyperlink patterns of documents, which are most influential?
- Basis of Google (eigenvector of link matrix $\rightarrow$ sparse matrix vector multiply)
- Applying Markov chain and perturbation theory to assess reliability
- Kernel ICA
- Estimate set of sources $s$ and mixing matrix $A$ from samples $x=A^{*} s$
- New way to sample such that sources are as independent as possible
- Again reduces to linear algebra kernels...


## More on Kernel ICA

- Algorithm 1
- nonlinear eigenvalue problem, reduces to a sequence of many
- very large generalized spd eigenproblems A - $\lambda$ B
- Block structured, A dense, B block diagonal
- Only smallest nonzero eigenvalue needed
- Sparse eigensolver (currently ARPACK/eigs)
- Use Incomplete Cholesky (IC) to get low rank approximzation to dense subblocks comprising $A$ and $B$
- Use Complete (=Diagonal) Pivoting but take only 20 << $n$ steps
- Cost is O(n)
- Evaluating matrix entries (exponentials) could be bottleneck
- Need fast, low precision exponential
- Algorithm 2
- Like Algorithm 1, but find all eigenvalues/vectors of $A-\lambda B$
- Use Holy Grail


## Future Work

- SciDAC
- Evaluate on SciDAC applications
- Determine interfaces for integration into SciDAC applications
- Further exploit Itanium, other architectures
- 128 (82-bit) floating point registers
- 9 HW formats: 24/8(v), 24/15, 24/17, 53/11, 53/15, 53/17, 64/15, 64/17
- Many fewer load/store instructions
- fused multiply-add instruction
- predicated instructions
- rotating registers for software pipelining
- prefetch instructions
- three levels of cache
- Tune current and wider set of kernels
- Improve heuristics, eg choice of $r \times c$
- Further automate performance tuning (NSF)
- Generation of algorithm space generators


## Background on Test Matrices

## Sparse Matrix Benchmark Suite (1/3)

| $\#$ | Matrix Name | Problem Domain | Dimension | No. Non-zeros |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: |
| 1 | dense | Dense matrix | 1,000 | 1.00 M |
| 2 | raefsky3 | Fluid structure interaction | 21,200 | 1.49 M |
| 3 | inaccura | Accuracy problem | 16,146 | 1.02 M |
| 4 | bcsstk35* | Stiff matrix automobile frame | 30,237 | 1.45 M |
| 5 | venkat01 | Flow simulation | 62,424 | 1.72 M |
| 6 | crystk02* | FEM crystal free-vibration | 13,965 | 969 k |
| 7 | crystk03* | FEM crystal free-vibration | 24,696 | 1.75 M |
| 8 | nasasrb* | Shuttle rocket booster | 54,870 | 2.68 M |
| 9 | 3dtube* | 3-D pressure tube | 45,330 | 3.21 M |
| 10 | ct20stif* | CT20 engine block | 52,329 | 2.70 M |
| 11 | bai | Airfoil eigenvalue calculation | 23,560 | 484 k |
| 12 | raefsky4 | Buckling problem | 19,779 | 1.33 M |
| 13 | ex11 | 3-D steady flow problem | 16,214 | 1.10 M |
| 14 | rdist1 | Chemical process simulation | 4,134 | 94.4 k |
| 15 | vavasis3 | 2-D PDE problem | 41,092 | 1.68 M |

Note: * indicates a symmetric matrix.

## Sparse Matrix Benchmark Suite (2/3)

| $\#$ | Matrix Name | Problem Domain | Dimension | No. Non-zeros |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: |
| 16 | orani678 | Economic modeling | 2,529 | 90.2 k |
| 17 | rim | FEM fluid mechanics problem | 22,560 | 1.01 M |
| 18 | memplus | Circuit simulation | 17,758 | 126 k |
| 19 | gemat11 | Power flow | 4,929 | 33.1 k |
| 20 | lhr10 | Chemical process simulation | 10,672 | 233 k |
| 21 | goodwin* | Fluid mechanics problem | 7,320 | 325 k |
| 22 | bayer02 | Chemical process simulation | 13,935 | 63.7 k |
| 23 | bayer10 | Chemical process simulation | 13,436 | 94.9 k |
| 24 | coater2 | Simulation of coating flows | 9,540 | 207 k |
| 25 | finan512* | Financial portfolio optimization | 74,752 | 597 k |
| 26 | onetone2 | Harmonic balance method | 36,057 | 228 k |
| 27 | pwt* | Structural engineering | 36,519 | 326 k |
| 28 | vibrobox* | Vibroacoustics | 12,328 | 343 k |
| 29 | wang4 | Semiconductor device simulation | 26,068 | 177 k |
| 30 | Insp3937 | Fluid flow modeling | 3,937 | 25.4 k |

## Sparse Matrix Benchmark Suite (3/3)

| $\#$ | Matrix Name | Problem Domain | Dimensions | No. Non-zeros |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: |
| 31 | Ins3937 | Fluid flow modeling | 3,937 | 25.4 k |
| 32 | sherman5 | Oil reservoir modeling | 3,312 | 20.8 k |
| 33 | sherman3 | Oil reservoir modeling | 5,005 | 20.0 k |
| 34 | orsreg1 | Oil reservoir modeling | 2,205 | 14.1 k |
| 35 | saylr4 | Oil reservoir modeling | 3,564 | 22.3 k |
| 36 | shyy161 | Viscous flow calculation | 76,480 | 330 k |
| 37 | wang3 | Semiconductor device simulation | 26,064 | 177 k |
| 38 | mcfe | Astrophysics | 765 | 24.4 k |
| 39 | jpwh991 | Circuit physics problem | 991 | 6,027 |
| 40 | gupta1* | Linear programming | 31,802 | 2.16 M |
| 41 | Ipcreb | Linear programming | $9,648 \times 77,137$ | 261 k |
| 42 | Ipcred | Linear programming | $8,926 \times 73,948$ | 247 k |
| 43 | Ipfit2p | Linear programming | $3,000 \times 13,525$ | 50.3 k |
| 44 | Ipnug20 | Linear programming | $15,240 \times 72,600$ | 305 k |
| 45 | Isi | Latent semantic indexing | $10 \mathrm{k} \times 255 \mathrm{k}$ | 3.7 M |

## Matrix \#2 - raefsky3 (FEM/Fluids)



## Matrix \#2 (cont'd) - raefsky3 (FEM/Fluids)

Matrix: raefsky 3 [1...75, 1...75]


## Matrix \#22 - bayer02 (chemical process simulation)



## Matrix \#22 (cont'd)- bayer02 (chemical process simulation)



## Matrix \#27 - pwt (structural engineering)



## Matrix \#27 (cont'd)- pwt (structural engineering)



## Matrix \#29 - wang4 (semiconductor device simulation)



## Matrix \#29 (cont'd)-wang4 (seminconductor device sim.)



## Matrix \#40-gupta1 (linear programming)



## Matrix \#40 (cont'd) - gupta1 (linear programming)



## Symmetric Matrix Benchmark Suite

| $\#$ | Matrix Name | Problem Domain | Dimension | No. Non-zeros |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: |
| 1 | dense | Dense matrix | 1,000 | 1.00 M |
| 2 | bcsstk35 | Stiff matrix automobile frame | 30,237 | 1.45 M |
| 3 | crystk02 | FEM crystal free vibration | 13,965 | 969 k |
| 4 | crystk03 | FEM crystal free vibration | 24,696 | 1.75 M |
| 5 | nasasrb | Shuttle rocket booster | 54,870 | 2.68 M |
| 6 | 3 dtube | 3-D pressure tube | 45,330 | 3.21 M |
| 7 | ct20stif | CT20 engine block | 52,329 | 2.70 M |
| 8 | gearbox | Aircraft flap actuator | 153,746 | 9.08 M |
| 9 | cfd2 | Pressure matrix | 123,440 | 3.09 M |
| 10 | finan512 | Financial portfolio optimization | 74,752 | 596 k |
| 11 | pwt | Structural engineering | 36,519 | 326 k |
| 12 | vibrobox | Vibroacoustic problem | 12,328 | 343 k |
| 13 | gupta1 | Linear programming | 31,802 | 2.16 M |

## Lower Triangular Matrix Benchmark Suite

| $\#$ | Matrix Name | Problem Domain | Dimension | No. of non-zeros |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | dense | Dense matrix | 1,000 | 500 k |
| 2 | ex11 | 3-D Fluid Flow | 16,214 | 9.8 M |
| 3 | goodwin | Fluid Mechanics, FEM | 7,320 | 984 k |
| 4 | Ihr10 | Chemical process simulation | 10,672 | 369 k |
| 5 | memplus | Memory circuit simulation | 17,758 | 2.0 M |
| 6 | orani678 | Finance | 2,529 | 134 k |
| 7 | raefsky4 | Structural modeling | 19,779 | 12.6 M |
| 8 | wang4 | Semiconductor device <br> simulation, FEM | 26,068 | 15.1 M |

## Lower triangular factor: Matrix \#2 - ex11



## Lower triangular factor: Matrix \#3 - goodwin



## Lower triangular factor: Matrix \#4 - Ihr10

## Extra Slides

## Symmetric Sparse Matrix-Vector Multiply on P4 (vs naïve symmetric = 1)



## Sparse Triangular Solve (mmd on $A^{T}+A$ ordering) on P4



## Sparse Triangular Solve (mmd on $A^{T *} A$ ordering) on P4



## Sparse Triangular Solve (best of 3 orderings) on P4



New slides from Rich

## Speed up from Cache Blocking on LSI matrix on P4



## Multiple Vector Performance on P4



## Multiple vector performance on P4 - by matrix type

Multiple Vector Performance [p4-icc]


## Multiple vector speedups on P4



## Single vector speedups on P4 by matrix type



## Performance Tuning

- Motivation: performance of many applications dominated by a few kernels
- MEMS CAD $\rightarrow$ Nonlinear ODEs $\rightarrow$ Nonlinear equations $\rightarrow$ Linear equations $\rightarrow$ Matrix multiply
- Matrix-by-matrix or matrix-by-vector
- Dense or Sparse
- Information retrieval by LSI $\rightarrow$ Compress termdocument matrix $\rightarrow$... $\rightarrow$ Sparse mat-vec multiply
-Information retrieval by LDA $\rightarrow$ Maximum likelihood estimation $\rightarrow$... $\rightarrow$ Solve linear systems
- Many other examples (not all linear algebra)


## Speed up from Cache Blocking on LSI matrix on Sun Ultra



## Possible Improvements



- Doesn't work as well as on Sun Ultra 1/170; Why?
- Current heuristic to determine best $r \times c$ block biased to diagonal of performance plot
- Didn't matter on Sun, does on P4 and Itanium since performance so "nondiagonally dominant"


## Sparsity reg blocking results on P4 for FEM/fluids matrices

Matrix \#2 (150 Mflops to 400 Mflops)


Matrix \#5 (50 Mflops to 350 Mflops)

Sparsity Performance on venkat01 (FEM Flow Simulation; \#5) [P4/icc]


## Possible collaborations with Intel

- Getting right tools
- Getting faster, less accurate transcendental functions
- Provide feedback on tools
- Provide tuned kernels, benchmarks, IR apps
- Provide system for tuning future kernels
- To provide users
- To evaluate architectural designs


## Millennium

## Millennium

- Cluster of clusters at UC Berkeley
- 309 CPU cluster in Soda Hall
- Smaller clusters across campus
- Made possible by Intel equipment grant
- Significant other support
- NSF, Sun, Microsoft, Nortel, campus
-www.millennium.berkeley.edu


## Millennium Topology



## Millennium Usage Oct 1-11, 2001

Snapshots of Millennium Jobs Running

$100 \%$ utilization for last few days
About half the jobs are parallel

## Usage highlights

- AMANDA
- Antarctic Muon And Neutrino Detector Array
- amanda.berkeley.edu
- 128 scientists from 15 universities and institutes in the U.S. and Europe.
- TEMPEST
- EUV lithography simulations via 3D electromagnetic scattering
- cuervo.eecs.berkeley.edu/Volcano/
- study the defect printability on multilayer masks
- Titanium
- High performance Java dialect for scientific computing
- www.cs.berkeley.edu/projects/titanium
- Implementation of shared address space, and use of SSE2
- Digital Library Project
- Large database of images
- elib.cs.berkeley.edu/
- Used to run spectral image segmentation algorithm for clustering, search on images


## Usage highlights (continued)

- CS 267
- Graduate class in parallel computing, 33 enrolled
- www.cs.berkeley.edu/~dbindel/cs267ta
- Homework
- Disaster Response
- Help find people after Sept 11, set up immediately afterwards
- safe.millennium.berkeley.edu
- 48 K reports in database, linked to other survivor databases
- MEMS CAD (MicroElectroMechanical Systems Computer Aided Design)
- Tool to help design MEMS systems
- Used this semester in EE 245, 93 enrolled
- sugar.millennium.berkeley.edu
- More later in talk
- Information Retrieval
- Development of faster information retrieval algorithms
- www.cs.berkeley.edu/~jordan
- More later in talk
- Many applications are part of CITRIS

